SAMURAI CONVERSION: THE CASE OF KUMAMOTO

GEORGE E. MOORE

IN THE SPRING OF 1876, REVEREND J. D. DAVIS — A TEACHER AT the recently opened Doshisha School in Kyoto—received a letter from Captain L. L. Janes, of whom he had never heard. The letter asked for help regarding a group of young samurai whom Captain Janes had converted to Protestant Christianity. Even on the surface, the adoption of Christianity (so characteristically Western) by samurai is intriguing. A close examination of that conversion will help to make clear some of the processes of cultural interaction; it will provide significant insight into the process of Japan's modernization.

The appearance of Perry at Uraga in 1853 and the increasing pressure by European powers upon Japan in the years following, threw Japan—and particularly the samurai class—into a state of profound turmoil. This turmoil manifested itself in what at, first sight, appears to be increasingly aberrational behavior on the part of the samurai, especially those in the southern and western domains. Some broke the laws closing the country and traveled to Europe and America to learn Western ways. Others risked their lives and reputations to study with foreigners in the treaty ports. Masterless samurai "patriots" roamed Edo and Kyoto and supported their beliefs through intimidation and assassination. Some actually abandoned their feudal lords; others began to talk of superseding the Tokugawa house; while still others argued for the reform of outmoded laws no longer viable under new conditions. Reactions to Western pressure ranged between extremes, but it was essentially of a positive nature. The samurai sought to do something: to take some action. He acted partly because his status had deteriorated, partly because he saw opportunities to improve himself, partly because of his concern with Japan's defense posture, but also because he was a samurai, with the soldier ethos of action (even irrational and hasty action). His actions showed a wide spectrum of behavior; conversion to Christianity was but an extreme example of such behavior.

The turmoil of the nation in the '50s and '60s was reflected within the domains as well. This was no less true of Kumamoto Domain than it was of any other. Kumamoto was rich, populous, and ruled by a lord enfeoffed by Iemitsu. Hosokawa, while indebted to the Tokugawa, was nonetheless an "outside" lord and his samurai shared much in common with those of Satsuma, Choshu and Tosa, who provided the leadership of the new Meiji government. Within the ranks of the samurai families who formed the domain government of Kumamoto were many shades of political opinion, and the struggles for supremacy in the council were often fierce. At the moment when the new Meiji government was formed, the conservative faction was in
control and refused to support the forces creating the new national government. Kumamoto’s failure denied to her samurai opportunities to serve there.

At the time, this did not appear to be a serious problem, for one son of Kumamoto had become a powerful voice among the new leadership and attained a high place in the central government. He was Yokoi Shonan, one of the truly influential thinkers preceding the Restoration. Shonan displayed prodigious talent as a student of Confucianism, but early abandoned official Chu Hsi as lacking in substance. After some time in Edo, he returned to Kumamoto and opened a school where he encouraged real or practical learning, hence Jitsugaku, in opposition to the arts and letters which orthodox Confucian education then required. His school attracted large numbers and his Jitsugaku Party became very influential in Kumamoto. Shonan came to advocate unlimited intercourse with foreign countries and sent two of his nephews to Rutgers College. For imagined advocacy of Christianity, he was assassinated by “patriots” in Kyoto, and Kumamoto found itself with absolutely no entree into the new central government. 1

The failure of the conservative faction and the succession of a new domain lord sympathetic with Shonan’s views, gave control of the domain government to the Jitsugaku supporters of Shonan. They decided to establish a school for Western learning by means of which young samurai could be prepared to compete for positions in the new government for the glory and honor of Kumamoto. Domain funds were allocated and an examination system established to select the brightest scholars. Although examinations were opened to all classes, the overwhelming majority of students selected came from the samurai class. All of them had studied the Chinese lessons which then made up the curriculum of the samurai schools, most of them under Jitsugaku Party teachers. 2 Although copies of the examination are not extant, the examiners undoubtedly sought those qualities which to them represented the best in the samurai ethos.

The students brought with them to the new school (called Yogakko) a combination of values made up of elements of Confucianism, especially that of Wang Yang-ming, which accorded more closely with Jitsugaku ideas, and Bushido—a system of ethical behavior for the samurai—and perhaps Zen Buddhism, as it permeated the culture of the samurai. It is fair to assume then that the Yogakko students were good scholars, versed in the Chinese classics, leavened with a strong dose of Jitsugaku pragmatism, steeped in the samurai tradition of loyalty, filial piety, class consciousness, self-confidence and trust in intuitive knowledge.

The authorities planned a school for Western learning but they were also concerned about maintaining the martial traditions in which Kumamoto prided itself. The master of the school—the lord made it clear—must not be “a

---


2 The influence of Yokoi Shonan upon the decision to establish the school and upon the thinking of those who established it was significant. In a sense, Shonan’s ideas represented a departure from orthodoxy in response to the times. Jitsugaku was still rooted in Confucianism, but its practicality and its emphasis upon pragmatism made it a stage which could lead to more radical behavior.
farmer, a mechanic, or a merchant: a military man was what was wanted.”

The school must resemble what Westerners might term a military academy. Nor should this desire seem odd. The training of the samurai bore some resemblance to that in a military academy. Students spent half of each day studying the Chinese classics and the remainder in military exercises. From the beginning of the Tokugawa period bun and bu were considered to be the two wheels of samurai education. Not only did Kumamoto want an officer to instruct its young men, there was also a hint of using his talents more directly if warfare should break out among the elements then jockeying for power.

The Kumamoto officials then approached Reverend Guido Verbeck to find a schoolmaster to fit their requirements. Verbeck wrote to his mission board secretary, J.M. Ferris in New York, who in turn got in touch with a well known missionary—Henry Scudder, then pastor of a church in San Francisco. Ferris must have known that Scudder’s daughter had recently married a young ex-Union army officer named L. L. Janes who, Ferris felt, to be just the person to teach in Kumamoto. The offer was made and accepted; word reached Kumamoto; Councilor Nonoguchi Tameyoshi—the official in charge of the school—was dispatched to Edo with a suitable retinue to conduct Janes and his family south.

Not much is known of Janes until he entered West Point. He was born in 1837 in New Philadelphia (Ohio), the son of a Presbyterian elder and a mother whose father had helped found the town. New Philadelphia was still something of a frontier town and the amenities of life were few. Presbyterians were rooted in puritanism. They believed in education, especially for their clergy, and their concept of full membership in the church body demanded rigorous catechetical training.

There was in frontier religion, however, a strong streak of revivalism which contrasted with the severely rational puritanism of Presbyterians. Revivals, in fact, contradicted much of that puritanism. It was anti-intellectual,

---

3 Kozaki Hiromichi, Reminiscences of Seventy Years (Tokyo, 1933) translated by Kozaki Nariaki, 11. For information about the Yogakko, I have relied for source material on this work together with Watase Tsunezaki, Ebina Danjo Sensei (Tokyo, 1938) and Saba Wataru, Uemura Masahisa to sono Jidai (Tokyo, 1937), I (hereafter Uemura). The best secondary study of the Yogakko is Sugii Mutsuro's excellent Kumamoto Yogakko in Nos. 4 (March, 1961) and 7 (April, 1963) of Kiristukyo Shakai Mondai Kenkyu, 24-42 and 143-237, respectively.

4 See page 153 of the second part of Sugii’s article cited above, which reproduces the contract signed by Janes upon landing. Article 2 of the contract states, “When employed in military matters, [Janes] salary will be reviewed.”

5 The contact was made through one of Shonan’s nephews who had studied with Verbeck in Nagasaki before going to Rutgers and had been forced to return from America because of illness. He was instrumental in getting the Yogakko established, but died before it opened.

6 Biographical data on Janes is sparse. I have consulted his military file in the Records of the Adjutant General, Record Group 94, “Appointment, Commission and Personal File Regarding Leroy L. Janes,” and his Pension File cited XC 2682-526, both from the National Archives of the United States. Further information regarding his military service can be examined in George W. Cullum Biographical Register of the Officers and Graduates of the U. S. Military Academy, etc., II, 544, and in the Official Register of the Officers and Cadets of the U. S. Military Academy at West Point, N. Y. for the years of his service as a cadet and instructor. There is also an excellent attempt to collect biographical and bibliographical data on Janes in Kindai Bungaku Kenkyu Sosho, X, 91-137, published by Joshi Digaku in Tokyo.
SAMURAI CONVERSION: THE CASE OF KUMAMOTO

highly emotional, and in effect offered salvation instantly upon the sinner's recognition of his own sinfulness and his throwing himself upon the mercy and saving grace of God. “Believe, and ye shall be saved,” taught the revivalist. There were enough Biblical precedents to cause most Presbyterians to accept the revival, to say nothing of the opportunity for emotional expression normally denied in religion and life.⁷

After a brief period studying law, Janes received an appointment to the U.S. Military Academy. He was always near the bottom of his class academically and earned a large number of demerits in his last two years. When the Civil War began, his class was graduated early and Janes was commissioned a second lieutenant of artillery. After training troops in Washington, D.C., he saw some action in the Shenandoah campaigns of 1862, but spent the next year as a staff officer. During the last two years of the war, he taught infantry and artillery tactics at the Military Academy and was then posted to Fort Stevens, Oregon, as its commander. By early 1868, he had tired of the peacetime army and resigned. He later said that peacetime soldiering was useless and frustrating and that was why he had abandoned it.⁸ In January 1869, he married Dr. Scudder's daughter in San Francisco and became closely associated with that missionary family.

Janes received the offer to teach in Kumamoto in the spring of 1871 and began to consider the kind of school which he should operate. For a model, he took Thomas Arnold's Rugby School in England and acquainted himself with its form and essence through a study of Arnold's life written by Dean Stanley. Boarding ship in San Francisco, Janes and his family landed in Yokohama in August 1871, taking with him a strong streak of American pragmatism and of American post-Civil War nationalism.

After signing a contract with Councillor Nonoguchi, Janes was escorted to Kumamoto and set about establishing the school, its rules and regulations and its curriculum. He administered the school, taught all subjects to all students, and supervised every detail of its operation. He was the school. The students lived in dormitories and their lives were severely circumscribed. The school's operations were patterned after Rugby and the strict regimen after the Military Academy. Janes was austere, self-disciplined and always carried himself like a soldier. He awoke early, began the day's activities early, and demanded a great deal from his students. He did not take a single vacation away from Kumamoto.⁹ He refused to learn Japanese, which made his students' task extraordinarily difficult. Yet, he took a deep interest in each

⁷ My understanding of mid-nineteenth century American religion is based primarily upon Smith, Hirlie Shelton, Robert T. Handy and Lefferts A. Loetscher, American Christianity: An Historical Interpretation with Representative Documents (New York, 1963), II, 1820-1961. I have also consulted Bernard Weisberger's They Gathered at the River (Boston, 1958).

⁸ At least, that is what he told his students, according to one of them, Ebina Danjo. Kindai Bungaku Kenkyu Socho, X, 93. The truth seems to be that Janes was asked to resign from the army because he was losing his sanity. An investigation was conducted of his behavior at Fort Stevens which attributed his loss of sanity to the death of his first wife and to "religious excitement." Memorandum of the Adjutant General's Office, dated 13 December 1866, in Janes' personal file from the Records of the Adjutant General, cited above.

⁹ Kozaki, op. cit., 12-14.
boy and, as he was the only instructor, he and his students became well acquainted indeed.\textsuperscript{10}

What did the Yogakko seem like from the students' point of view? The language and study materials were foreign like the instructor. The entire environment and experience were strange.\textsuperscript{11} Yet, there must have been much that struck a familiar note. First, the samurai accepted booklearning as a necessary part of their equipment as loyal samurai. These students—having been selected from the best of the young domain scholars—were not adverse to diligent study.\textsuperscript{12} Further, Janes' pedagogical techniques were not so far removed from those of the masters of the domain school. Rote memory, rotating recitation and lectures were common to both. Subject matter differed, of course, but even the more practical subjects could be accepted in the light of the influence of Shonan's Jitsugaku.

Highly motivated, able, in constant contact with Janes, it is not too difficult to see why many of the Yogakko students came under his influence. Even in his person, he had many of the qualities which samurai so admired. With these qualities, Janes brought that fund of knowledge which the students, their families, and the domain authorities were convinced would catapult Kumamoto into the arena of national affairs.

As time went by, certain students began to show decided superiority. When a new class entered in 1872, Janes, unable to instruct everyone, transferred some of the burden of teaching to them. This, too, was consonant with the method of the samurai school. Others could not meet the academic mark or misbehaved, and Janes ruthlessly weeded out both—a Rugby dictum.

As the students improved in their ability to grasp and understand the English language, they began to be influenced by Janes' beliefs and thought. Most of the students in the first two classes—those whom Janes influenced most profoundly—had planned to become Ministers and Councilors in the new government in Tokyo: an ambition perfectly in accord with, and limited by, their social class and rank. Under Janes' instruction, the students gradually came to accept alternative possibilities in engineering, mining, manufacturing and the like. Student acceptance of the possibility of economic activity should not be attributed so much to Janes' charismatic guidance as to the willingness of the samurai as a class to undertake much that had been forbidden under the old order. What Janes said was what many samurai had discovered.

Time further isolated the students from any influence outside the school. Confucian instruction was limited to Sundays. Instruction in the martial arts ceased. The students, to a remarkable degree, were under the influence of Janes and they gradually transferred to him their respect as their teacher. Their youth made the transfer easier. The values developed by their samurai

\textsuperscript{10} Uemura, op. cit., 516. Also Kozaki, op. cit., 12.

\textsuperscript{11} One of Janes' students, Tokutomi Soho, mentions glass windows, meat and bread and shelves for beds. "...Within [the school] American life went on." Uemura, op. cit., 509.

\textsuperscript{12} The selection process by examination, fairly rigid at first, slackened badly toward the end. Tokutomi mentions that over half of the students in his class had been admitted without qualifying. Even in the first class, some were admitted without examination. Kozaki was excused because the examiner knew of his excellence at the domain school.
environment continued to operate. Their military training and ethos made the object of loyalty the one who was most significant in their lives; but Janes, in these circumstances, absorbed the filial loyalty demanded by their Confucian ethic, as well.\(^{13}\)

What must be understood is that the gradual separation of some Yogakko students from their heritage was the product of their school environment, rather than a result of the pressures upon their class in a modernizing Japan. Like most of their class in this period, they were anxious to explore new possibilities, to seek new avenues to whatever goals they set themselves. The students entered the Yogakko with vigor and enthusiasm. Without losing either, they left the mainstream, diverted by Janes. But the diversion was not sharp or sudden; there was no feeling of being suddenly cast adrift, but a gradual steady moving away which required no essential modification of their value system.

Toward the end of his third year in Kumamoto (or the beginning of his fourth), Janes suggested that there was more to Western culture than the secular education which the students were then receiving. He told them that in religion would be found the essence of the West and the reasons for its strength, superiority and success. Janes then said that he would conduct Bible study and prayer meetings in his quarters for those who might wish to discover Christianity.

Naturally enough, not all the students elected to hear Janes. Inability to understand him tended to limit those who attended to the better upperclassmen. Antagonism to Christianity and the hated Bible kept most away.\(^{14}\) Curiosity brought some, but others left because Janes appeared ridiculous to them. There began to be a grouping of students into two elements: those who favored Janes, succeeded under him, and were interested in Christianity; those who opposed Janes, were generally less apt in English, and were violently opposed to Christianity.

Janes’ brand of religion—that mixture of puritanism and revivalism—tended to emphasize the emotional, rather than the intellectual. In this respect, Janes was simply exhibiting a form of religious behavior which, by this time, was common in the American Protestant denominations and was supremely manifested by Henry Ward Beecher, whom Janes admired.\(^{15}\) Upon those students studying Christianity with him, however, Janes’ behavior was most influential. He was a man of ethical thought and behavior, who had won their respect as a teacher. The intensity of his prayers, his obvious concern for the welfare of them and of Japan, the Christian concern with their salvation: all these, moved them profoundly. In Janes’ religion, many of his students found a new (and to them a higher) loyalty. By the winter of 1875, a kind of revival spirit began to take hold of this group. A condition of intense excitement developed, fed by Janes’ exhortations.\(^{16}\) In this state, a group of about thirty-

---

\(^{13}\) Another student, Kanamori Tsurin, wrote that Janes “was truly a teacher who loved us; like a father he thought of us.” Uemura, op. cit., 517.

\(^{14}\) Ibid., 321.

\(^{15}\) Ibid., 322.

\(^{16}\) Kozaki remembered that “some, on those cold winter days bathed in freezing water in order, as they said, to strengthen their faith.” Kozaki, op. cit., 19. See also Uemura, op. cit., 518. Very samurai.
five climbed Mt. Hanaoka outside the city of Kumamoto, and pledged themselves to the defense of their new faith. They also declared that patriotism required them to proselytize the nation: to this, they should devote their lives. After consultation with Davis of Doshisha, Janes baptized twenty-two of them on 3 April 1876, and celebrated the Lord’s Supper.\(^7\)

By this time, of course, the converts had become alienated—in a sense—from their traditional society. This became painfully apparent when the incident on Mt. Hanaoka became known. Many converts were summarily removed from the school by their families and subjected to severe persecution. The widow of Shonan and mother of Yokoi Tokio threatened to commit suicide. The father of Yoshida Sakuya threatened to behead him. The famous Jitsugaku teacher, Takezaki Sado, came to persuade Kanamori Tsurin to abandon his new faith and failed, whereupon he was locked up in solitary confinement. The school, itself, was closed by the authorities in the summer of 1876 and Janes left for Osaka, where he was employed for a short time in a government school teaching science.

What is fascinating about the persecutions, however, is not so much that a surprising number resisted, or that some—like Tokutomi Soho—succeeded. It is their behavior, under persecution, that is revealing. Yokoi Tokio decided to commit suicide with his mother because he could not abide the thought of his mother going to hell while he went to heaven. Yoshida said that he could think of no better way to die than at his father’s hands. Kanamori asked the great teacher why he would not allow investigation of Christianity when he had urged the investigation of all things in his teaching.\(^8\) In each case, the convert responded in traditional terms, not in a rejection of that tradition. The values which sustained them in persecution were samurai values: stoicism in the face of adversity, loyalty to the lord, ethical behavior and dedication, and so on. In the samurai code, the lord took precedence over the father.

The conversion process as recorded by one of Janes’ students, Kozaki Hiromichi, is interesting. Kozaki was not one of the Hanaoka covenanters and seems to have arrived at his faith after considerably more agony than the others. He began as a Confucian and “stood on the words of the Analects, ‘The study of strange doctrines is indeed injurious,’ and opposed the study of Christianity.”\(^9\) He had been trained in the orthodox Chu Hsi Confucianism of the domain school, but under the influence of the Jitsugaku teacher, Takezaki, he moved towards the philosophy of Wang Yang-ming. Takezaki, he remembered, as lecturing with great earnestness, “his words seemed to well up from the very depths of his heart—so much so, in fact, that the audience was invariably impressed.”\(^10\)

---

\(^7\) Uemura, op. cit., 519. The anti-Janes party met at the same time on the same date in the park of the Suizen Temple in opposition. Among them was one Yokoi Tokiyoshi, a kinsman of Shonan and of the convert Yokoi Tokio. Ibid., 520.

\(^8\) See Kozaki, op. cit., 21-23 and Uemura, op. cit., 502-508.

\(^9\) Kozaki, op. cit., 18-19.

\(^10\) Ibid., 33. Tokutomi, at 13—some seven years junior to Kozaki—remembered Takezaki’s lectures: “Truly, they did not stir my soul.” Uemura, op. cit., 513. Later, he referred to them as “moldy.” Ibid., 514.
As Janes’ meetings progressed, Kozaki was persuaded to attend.

At the first meeting I attended, what struck me most forcibly was Captain Janes’ prayer. Fundamentally opposed as I was to such religious practices, once I heard him pray I could not help being powerfully impressed. While all the others were attentively listening with bowed heads, I alone kept my eyes open and gazed at him to see the way he prayed. His face was glowing with earnestness, and the words he used in praying for those present, for men in general, and for Japan and the world grew gradually more and more fervent till I, cold and obstinate though I was, could not help being most deeply impressed.21

Then began a period of intense study of Christianity. Yet, Kozaki was faced with a dilemma: the rationalism of his Confucian training rebelled against his becoming a Christian; “yet to turn away from Christianity and be content with Confucianism would leave my spirit of inquiry unsatisfied. This dilemma so wrought on me that I had a nervous breakdown.” So he went to Janes for help. Janes said, “as a horse or dog however wise cannot comprehend man’s mind, and similarly an ignorant or small man cannot understand the conduct of the learned and wise, even so man can in no wise know the holy will of the omniscient and almighty, the supremely good and supremely loving God. With such words,” continued Kozaki, “did he take away the veil from my eyes. Upon my return home that night I had a great awakening...” 22

From this time on Kozaki progressed in faith and Janes baptized him with the others. Kozaki claimed that the staunchness of his faith grew not only out of the time and thought and mental anguish spent in becoming a Christian, but also out of his Confucian heritage. He compared himself to the Biblical Paul, who was proud of his pre-Christian faith. Citing Christ’s statement that he had come to fulfill, not abrogate the law, Kozaki claimed that, “we embraced Christianity, because we believed that it fulfills the spirit and real import of Confucianism.” 23

There may be some doubt as to the validity of Kozaki’s notion that Christianity was the fulfillment of Confucianism. In another way, however, it may be significant. Combined with the military urge to action, and Zen concepts of truth through enlightenment, the Wang Yang-ming emphasis on intuitive knowledge may have been the intellectual and emotional framework which, when combined with Janes’ apocalyptic faith and revealed religion, made conversion possible, given the conditions then obtaining at the Yogakko. This explanation does no violence to the value system of either party. It does help in understanding the process of conversion, without resorting to explanations of initial alienation and search for alternatives on the part of the converts.

The Yogakko converts were young samurai, part and parcel of the domain elite. In the parlous '70s, a group of men from this elite, seeking positively to overcome an initial disadvantage, established a school by means of which family and domain fortunes could be advanced. That they chose this way indicates, not a feeling of frustration over events beyond their control,
but an active effort to correct a bad situation. Into this project the young students threw themselves with remarkable energy. They were eager and talented, and their efforts had the full weight of parental and family approval behind them. In fact, upon their success lay the hopes of them all. They were full of youthful vitality, optimism and idealism. Janes channeled this energy in a new direction. His converts believed that they had a new and better way to which they could commit themselves in service to their nation and her people. That they had accepted the hated and feared religion, aroused great resentment from families who had wagered all on the future of their offspring and who felt betrayed by them. But the converts saw themselves as now prepared to better lead their nation to new and greater opportunities.

The conversion of samurai to Protestant Christianity was admittedly an extreme response to the West. But if the converts did not seek Christianity to compensate for a felt alienation from their families and society, then their behavior is generally similar to that of other samurai of the period who were in various ways actively responding to the crisis imposed by the West. The converts were samurai and, therefore, shared with their class a common educational and social background, military training in youth, search for opportunity for achievement in the unsettled conditions of the time, and above all, a desire for action. They believed in loyalty, courage and hard work. They were strongly conscious of their class and its heritage.

All during the Tokugawa era, the task of the samurai class was the governing of the domain and the maintenance of internal stability and peace. Form and order were, therefore, the goals and the system was sustained with remarkable strength. The power of the samurai class was not challenged. With the coming of the West, that power was challenged in military terms; the new tasks became the defense of the country, which was of course the raison d'être of the class, and the restoration of power, if not to the whole class, at least, to those who could achieve it. To these ends, the samurai immediately began an active search for means. Their restless and vigorous search took many paths and Christianity was but one of them.

The conversion of the Kumamoto Band, as Janes' converts came to be called, can be seen then as part of the process of breakdown and renewal. Like most samurai, they were conscious of the importance of the goals and willing to experiment in ways to achieve them. The coincidence of Janes and the Yogakko drew them into a radical response which but more clearly illuminates the nature of the samurai reaction to the West.

This response must be recognized and understood if the modernization of Japan is to be seen as something more than an accident. The samurai class never lost its power until the changes its leadership was willing to make, disintegrated it. Even then, it led and dominated Japan for a generation during which modernization took place. Regardless of the preconditions which may have existed, samurai leadership made modernization possible.

24 Curiously enough, some of the mothers who persecuted their sons most severely became themselves converts. Both the mothers of Yokoi and Tokutomi became Christian. Even the wife of the great Jitsugaku teacher, Takezaki, was converted. Uemura op. cit., 515.